Geophysical and Mineralogical Controls on the Rheology of Fracture Slip and Seal Breaching DE-FE0023354

Derek Elsworth, Yi Fang, Chaoyi Wang, Yunzhong Jia, Kyungjae Im, Ziyan Li, Penn State Jeffrey Fitts, Catherine Peters, Kasparas Spokas, Princeton

> U.S. Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory Mastering the Subsurface Through Technology Innovation, Partnerships and Collaboration: Carbon Storage and Oil and Natural Gas Technologies Review Meeting

> > August 13-16, 2018

Presentation Outline

- Technical Status
- Accomplishments
- Lesson Learned
- Synergistic Opportunities
- Summary [Repeat of Lessons Learned]

Technical Status & Methodology

Background

- Felt seismicity
 - Stable versus unstable slip
 - Mineralogical controls
 - Geometric (stiffness) controls
- Seal breaching
 - Evolution of permeability and capillary characteristics

Methodology

- Collect, Synthesize and Characterize Sedimentary Formation Samples (Fitts, Lead)
 - Collect Homogeneous and Mineralogically Complex Sedimentary Rocks (Peters)
 - Sinter Mineral Mixtures to Create Idealized Analogs of Sedimentary Rocks (Fitts)
 - Conduct Baseline Characterization of Natural and Synthetic Caprocks (Fitts)
- Laboratory Experimentation (Elsworth, Lead)
 - Evolution of Fault Rheology and Transport Parameters (Elsworth)
 - 3D Imaging of fault contact area, fault geometry, and mineralogy & textures (Fitts)
 - Modeling for Response and for Caprock Screening (Elsworth, Lead)
 - Digital Rock Physics Modeling of Response (Elsworth)
 - Caprock Screening Heuristics (Peters, Fitts)

Induced Seismicity



[Elsworth et al., Science, 2016]

Subduction Zone Megathrusts and the Full Spectrum of Fault Slip Behavior



Ide et al., 2007; Peng & Gomberg, 2010

Seismic – Aseismic Transition Full Spectrum of Slip Behaviors





 $K_{c} = \underbrace{(\sigma_{n} - p)(a - b)}_{D_{c}} \ge \underset{l}{\overset{G}{\overset{}}} = K$ Promote Aseismic Response: $K_{c} < K$ Otherwise Seismic Slip if: $K_{c} > K$ Increase: $K_{c}; (\sigma_{n} - p); (a - b); l$ Decrease: $D_{c}; G$

Recurrence Requires: *Healing*



[Adapted from C.J. Marone, Pers. Comm., 2017]

Nascent Friction-Stability-Permeability Relationships



Observations

- dk/k0 increases with increased brittleness (a-b)<0
- dk/k0 increases with increased frictional strength
- Roles of mineralogy and surface roughness?



Seismicity-Permeability Linkages – Natural Samples



Net Friction and Permeability Evolution



Experimental Method

- Slide-hold-slide with saw cut Green River shale (2 mm slide 12 hours hold)
- Strain gage measures fault normal deformation
- Surface Profile measured by optical profilometry



g3.ems.psu.edu

Result – Permeability Evolution

- Cyclic permeability evolution is apparent •
- Strong permeability decline at initial shear-in •
- Shear Permeability enhancement become more significant at later stage slips •



Result - Strain Gage Measurement

- Shear slips are associated with dilation but with one exceptional case plot (c)
- Normal compaction is apparent during hold (without exception)
- Magnitude of cyclic compaction/dilation is ~1 micron



Time Dependent Static Compaction

- Compaction approximately follows power law with power exponent ~0.2-0.4
- Compaction magnitude is a few microns (decreases during later stage holds)
- Magnitude of the mechanical and hydraulic compaction are similar but not identical
 - $\Delta b_s > \Delta b_h$ for first hold and $\Delta b_h > \Delta b_s$ for later hold



Surface Profile Evolution

- Strong comminution and flattening observed •
- Comminution effect is significantly reduced at 2nd shear •
- Small scale roughness develops on planed surface





Discussion - Hypothetical Compaction and Matedness

- Two 1mm planed surface are hypothetically compacted assuming:
 - Mineral dissolution at real contact (pressure solution)
 - Dissolution rates are equal on upper and lower surfaces
- Pre-slip compaction likely determines the following shear permeability evolution





derek.elsworth@psu.edu

Frictional-Stability-Permeability and Reaction

Experiments:

- Eagle Ford Shale
- Two fluids:
 - pH 2.5
 - pH 7.8
- xCT Imaging before and after flow



zone after slip.

Frictional-Stability-Permeability and Reaction

- 1. Permeability change during compression of fracture coupons.
 - From 250 kPa to 2500-3000 kPa confining pressure.
 - Compression of porous altered layer leads to lower permeability, likely to due compaction/creation of gauge
- 2. Permeability evolution during first 1.5mm of slip.
 - Permeability does not evolve systematically, likely controlled by unique sample geometries.
 - Maximum permeability increase observed for sample with altered layer and vice versa.



Stability-Permeability Relations in Composites/Mixtures



2D Model Configuration



DEM model configuration as a symmetric simplification of a double direct shear apparatus: (a) uniform mixtures; (b) textured (layered) mixtures; inset on the right-hand-side shows the variation of quartz (orange) to talc (blue) content/relative layer thickness in uniform/layered mixtures.

> Schematic of the contact model: the friction coefficient of a local contact starts to evolve upon a slip event together with a difference between global load point velocity and stored global reference velocity friction will reach a peak and continue to evolve to its steady state if local slip persists either according velocityto strengthening or velocity-weakening; if slip halted before reaching steady state, the friction coefficient will state as-is; friction evolution of newly formed contact will be reset and evolve from the beginning (left to right).



Model configuration represents one half of the double direct shear configuration (Mair & Marone, 1999). (a) Double direct shear configuration; (b) DEM model for homogeneous mixtures; (c) Layered/textured mixture.

(a) Contact model between two particles comprises linear elastic components in the local shear and normal directions with a moment-based rolling resistant component (k_r); (b) modified slip-weakening constitutive relation acting at each particle-particle contact.



(a) Typical friction evolution curve of a uniform mixture of talc and quartz (0% talc and 100% talc are shown); (b) (a-b) of uniform mixture plotted against talc weight percentage, shaded area indicates trend; (c) (a-b) of layered mixture plotted against talc weight percentage, zoomin view shows a comparison of the weight scale with the uniform mixture, shaded area indicates increasing trend of (a-b)



Uncorrected/corrected evolution of sample layer thickness with shear displacement for (a) a 10% talc-quartz mixture; (b) a 90% talc-quartz mixture; (c) local normalized permeability evolution of 10% and 90% talc-quartz mixtures estimated from local porosity evolution; (d) evolution of average coordination number of 10% and 90% talc-quartz mixtures.

Accomplishments to Date

VS and SHS Experiments

- Mechanisms-based seismicity-permeability evolution RSF-k
- VS experiments on broad suite of natural and artificial samples
- Stability-permeability relations (indicate larger stability smaller dk)
- Important role of healing on perm-cycle and seismicity defined
- Important role of reactive transport on perm-evolution and friction/stability
- Imaging
 - Frozen post-test fractures
 - Completed imaging and segmentation of sheared fractures
- Modeling
 - DRP models for friction and stability gouge compared with mixtures data
 - Enables testing of laboratory data for stability and permeability
 - Developed RT models for stiffness and permeability evolution of fractures

Lessons Learned/Summary

- Friction-Stability-Healing Behavior – Related to Permeability

- RSF-k is a viable method to link permeability-response
 - Linkage correct when strength to stress ratio is high
 - Linkage incorrect where wear products predominate response
- Stability-permeability relations (indicate increasing stability -> smaller dk)
- Friction-instability follows observed norms on mineralogy
 - Quartz predominantly unstable permeability increase
 - Carbonates and Clays predominantly stable permeability decrease
- Important role of healing on perm-cycle and seismicity defined
 - Short hold times/repose then compactive deformation and small permeability increase or drop
 - Long hold times/repose then dilation and increased permeability increase
- · Important role of reactive transport on perm-evolution in fracture walls
 - High porosity zone in Eagle Ford shale where carbonate leached
 - » But compaction and reactivation results in collapse and loss of permeability
 - Mineralogic transformation Hematite-> Goethite results in changes in stability and permeability (conforms)
- Modeling
 - DRP models for friction and stability gouge compared with mixtures data
 - Local contact models confirm laboratory data for stability and permeability

Synergistic Opportunities

- <u>TILT.princeton.edu</u>

- Linkages with:
 - Explored broad suite of mineralogies that are applicable to various CO₂ demonstration projects and others
 - Projects exploring field scale response -URLs and field experimentation (Guglielmi, Aix-Marseille & LBNL)
 - Seismicity-permeability correlations
 - Linkages across scales for upscaling
 - LSBB (Carbonate), Tournemire (Shale), Mt Terri (Shale)
 - EGS Collab
 - Imaging in vivo (Dustin Crandall)





Lessons Learned/Summary [Repeated]

Friction-Stability-Healing Behavior – Related to Permeability

- RSF-k is a viable method to link permeability-response
 - Linkage correct when strength to stress ratio is high
 - Linkage incorrect where wear products predominate response
- Stability-permeability relations (indicate increasing stability -> smaller dk)
- Friction-instability follows observed norms on mineralogy
 - Quartz predominantly unstable permeability increase
 - Carbonates and Clays predominantly stable permeability decrease
- Important role of healing on perm-cycle and seismicity defined
 - Short hold times/repose then compactive deformation and small permeability increase or drop
 - Long hold times/repose then dilation and increased permeability increase
- · Important role of reactive transport on perm-evolution in fracture walls
 - High porosity zone in Eagle Ford shale where carbonate leached
 - » But compaction and reactivation results in collapse and loss of permeability
 - Mineralogic transformation Hematite-> Goethite results in changes in stability and permeability (conforms)
- Modeling
 - DRP models for friction and stability gouge compared with mixtures data
 - Local contact models confirm laboratory data for stability and permeability

Appendix Following

Benefit to the Program

Addresses:

Area of Interest 1, Geomechanical Research

.....to determine the constraints of whether seals transected by blind faults will fail seismically or aseismically when contacted by increased reservoir pressures including CO_2 and the implications of this rupture on seal breaching and loss of inventory.

Relevance to FOA ("in italics")

This project will provide:

"improved understanding of geomechanical processes and impacts critical to scCO2 injection operations.

This [project specifically] *includes* [and integrates]: *theoretical studies, [and] laboratory, work to:*

(a) evaluate and assess the probability of induced seismicity;

(b) understand, characterize, and measure potential permeability changes from slip along existing faults; and

(c) understand and assess the geomechanical behavior and effects of increased reservoir pressure on fractures, faults, and sealing formations."

This will include.....

Project Overview: Goals and Objectives

Examine geophysical and mineralogical controls of caprocks on:

- Fault slip Stable/unstable or aseismic/seismic
- **Permeability evolution** Sense and magnitude
- **Potential for seal breaching** Permeability and capillary behavior **Including**:
- *Nature, form and rates of weakening* that condition whether fractures and faults fail either seismically or aseismically
- *Nature, form and rates of healing* that define whether fractures may strengthen and then re-fail on multiple successive occasions, and
- *Permeability evolution (enhancement or destruction)* that is driven on fractures as a consequence of these behaviors
- Feedbacks on healing conditioned both by *physical and chemical transformations* and the redistribution of mineral mass driven by fluid transport.

Organization Chart/ Communication Plan



Gantt Chart

SCHEDULE of TASKS and MILESTONES		BP1 Oct 2014 to Sept 2015				BP2 Oct 2015 to Sept 2016				BP3 Oct 2016 to Sept 2017				
	PI	Y1Q1	Y1Q2 J F N	Y1Q3	Y1Q4 J A S	Y2Q1	Y2Q2 J F M	Y2Q3 A M J	Y2Q4 J A S	Y3Q1	Y3Q2 J F M	Y3Q3 A M J	Y3Q4 J A S	
Task 1 Project management and planning	Esw orth													
Task 2 Collect, synthesize and characterize	Fitts													
SubTask 2.1 – Collect Homogeneous and Mineralogically	Peters													
SubTask 2.2 – Sinter Mineral Mixtures to Create(Fitts) Idealized Analogs of Sedimentary Rocks	Fitts	-		-										
SubTask 2.3 – Conduct Baseline Characterization of Natural and Synthetic Caprocks (Fitts)	Fitts							-						
Task 3 Laboratory Experimentation	⊟sw orth													
Subtask 3.1 Evolution of Fault Rheology and Transport Parameters	Elsw orth							-						
Subtask 3.2 3D Imaging of fault contact area, fault geometry, and mineralogy & textures	Fitts													
Task 4 Modeling for Response and Caprock Screening	Elsw orth													
Subtask 4.1 Digital rock physics of response Subtask 4.2 Caprock screening heuristics	Elsw orth Peters/Fitts													
														L

Bibliography [y4]

- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Jia, Y. (2018) Mineralogical controls on frictional strength, stability and shear permeability evolution of fractures. J. Geophys. Res. Vol. 123. <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2017JB015338</u>
- Jia, Y., Lu, Y., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Tang, J. (2018) Surface characteristics and permeability enhancement of shale fractures due to water and supercritical carbon dioxide fracturing. J. Pet. Sci. and Eng. Vol. 165, pp. 284-297. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.petrol.2018.02.018
- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Cladouhos, T.T. (2018) Reservoir permeability mapping using microearthquake data. Geothermics. Vol. 72, pp. 83-100. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geothermics.2017.10.019</u>
- Im, K.J., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y. (2018) The influence of preslip sealing on the permeability evolution of fractures and faults. Geophys. Res. Let., Vol. 45. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/2017GL076216</u>
- Im, K.J., Elsworth, D., Marone, C., Leeman, J. (2017) The impact of frictional healing on stick-slip recurrence interval and stress drop: implications for earthquake scaling. J. Geophys. Res.. Vol. 122. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JB014476 pdf</u>
- Zhang, F., Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Yang, X. (2017) Evolution of friction and permeability in a propped fracture under shear. Geofluids. Vol. 2017, 13 pp. <u>https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/2063747 pdf</u>
- Sang, G., Elsworth, D., Liu, S., Harpalani, S. (2017) Characterization of swelling modulus and effective stress coefficient accommodating sorption-induced swelling in coal. Energy and Fuels. Vol. 31, No. 9. pp 8843-8851.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1021/acs.energyfuels.7b00462_pdf
- Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y. (2017) Influence of weakening minerals on the ensemble strength and slip stability of faults. J. Geophys. Res. Vol. 122. pp 7090-7110. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2016JB013687 pdf</u>
- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Fitts, J.P. (2017) Frictional stability-permeability relationships for fractures in shales. J. Geophys. Res., Vol. 122, pp. 1760-1776. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2016JB013435</u>
- Fang, Y., Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Ishibashi, T. (2017) Seismicity-permeability coupling in the behaviour of gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. Geomech. Geophys Geo-energ. Geo-resour.. Vol. 3, No. 2. pp. 189-198. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s40948-017-0051-9</u>

Bibliography – Presentations [y4]

- Elsworth, D., Wang, J., Zhi, S., Liu, J., Liu, S., Cao, Y., Gan, Q., Marone, C., Connolly, P., Alpern, J., Lu, Y., Culp, B., Im, K.J.,, Zhu, G., Guglielmi, Y. (2018) Permeability evolution in naturally and artificially fractured reservoirs. Expert Forum: Innovative Path of Oil and Gas Exploration and Development in Energy Transition. CNPC RIPED, Beijing. August 1-2. [Plenary]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Schwartz, B., Li, Z., Yildirim, E., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Madara, AN, M., Zhang, .F., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2018. Fault reactivation and permeability evolution in reservoirs and caprocks. CNPC Northwest Geological Institute, Lanzhou, China, June 6. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Schwartz, B., Li, Z., Yildirim, E., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Madara, AN, M., Zhang, .F., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2018. Induced seismicity and permeability evolution in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. Petroleum Engineering, China University of Petroleum, Qingdao. June 1. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Schwartz, B., Li, Z., Yildirim, E., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Madara, AN, M., Zhang, .F., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2018. Induced seismicity and permeability evolution in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. GeoShanghai, Shanghai, China. May 27-30. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Schwartz, B., Li, Z., Yildirim, E., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Madara, B., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2018. Induced seismicity and permeability evolution in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. University Lecture. University of Science and Technology, Hefei, China. May 24. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Samuelson, J., Marone, C. 2018. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. University of Southern California, Chemical Engineering and Materials Science Distinguished Lecture Series. April 12. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Samuelson, J., Marone, C. 2018. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. Northeastern University, Shenyang. April 2. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Schwartz, B., Madara, B., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2018. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. Kumamoto University, Japan. February 2. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Schwartz, B., Feng, Z., Liu, J, Wang, S., Izadi, G., Kumar, H., Li, X., Han, G., Liu, S., Marone, C. 2017. Controls on permeability evolution in fractured-sorbing media. EOS Trans. AGU Fall Meeting, New Orleans, Abstract H21K-02. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Schwartz, B., Madara, B., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. Taiyuan University of Technology, China. October 26. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Schwartz, B., Madara, B., Riviere, J., Shokoui, P., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. 15th Int. Conf. of the Int. Assoc. for Comp. Meth. and Adv. In Geomechs. Wuhan, China. October 20-25. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Schwartz, B., Marone, C. 2017. Evolution of transport properties of faults through the seismic cycle. 4th Int. Symp. On Unconventional Geomechanics. Shenyang, China. October 16-17. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. 14th Young Scholars Conference. Chinese Soc. R. Mechs., Northeastern University, Shenyang. October 14-15. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Fault-reactivation and permeability evolution in reservoirs and caprocks. Int. Symp. on Fault Deformation, Sealing and Fluid Migration. Daqing, China. September 21-23. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Deformation and permeability evolution in reservoirs and seals with a focus on well survival. Int. Conf. on Shale Gas Eng. Geomechs. Beijing. July 19-21. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Samuelson, J., Marone, C. 2016. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. 51st U.S. Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics, San Francisco. June 25-28. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Key geomechanics challenges for wasteless recovery of energy and fuels. Int. Workshop on Grand Challenges in Mining Engineering. China University of Mining and Technology, Beijing. June 18. [Invited] and Northeastern University. June 21. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Marone, C., Connolly, P., Alpern, J., Lu, Y., Culp, B., Im, K.J., Wang, J.H., Zhu, W.C., Liu, J.S., Guglielmi, Y., Li, X., Feng, Z. 2017. Prospects for Gas Fracturing in unconventional reservoirs. Henan Polytechnic University, June 15. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprcks [the good, the bad, and the ugly]. YSRM 2017 4th ISRM Young Scholars' Symposium on Rock Mechanics. May 10-12. Jeju Island, S. Korea. [Keynote] and Chinese Academy of Sciences, Wuhan, May 19. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in porous and fractured media. Interpore 2017. May 8-11. Rotterdam. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. Univ. Texas, Petroleum and Geosystems Engineering. April 24. [Invited]