Reversible Solid Oxide Cell Degradation: Characterization, Simulation, and Mitigation





Harry Abernathy, Ph.D. Team Lead, NETL SOC R&D

23rdAnnual Solid Oxide Fuel Cell Project Review Meeting

October 26, 2022

Outline

- Introduction
- Recent Progress
 - Cell and Stack Degradation Modeling and Simulation
 - Electrode Design and Engineering
 - Strategic Systems Analysis and Engineering



• Wrap-Up





SOFC FY22 FWP Personnel



NETL (Federal Staff)

- Anthony Burgard (PGH)
- Billy Epting (Task 2 PI, ALB)
- Gregory Hackett (Task 4 PI, MGN)
- Harry Abernathy (TPL, Task 3 PI, MGN)
- Jay Liu (MGN)
- Rich Pineault (MGN)
- Sam Bayham (Task 5 PI, MGN)
- Wissam Saidi (PGH)
- Youhai Wen (ALB)
- Yuhua Duan (PGH)
- Yves Mantz (MGN)

Carnegie Mellon University

- Paul Salvador (MSE)
- Liz Holm (MSE)
- Hokon Kim (PhD student)
- William Kent (PhD student)
- Rachel Kurchin (MSE)

Georgia Southern University

• Hayri Sezer (Eng&Tech)

NETL (Site Support Contracts)

- Alex Noring (KeyLogic/PGH)
- Arun Iyengar (KeyLogic/PGH)
- Biao Zhang (LRST/MGN)
- Bo Guan (LRST/MGN)
- Farida Harun (LRST/MGN)
- Fei Xue (LRST/ALB)
- Kyle Buchheit (KeyLogic/PGH)
- Lynn Fan (LRST/MGN)
- Rick Addis (SOS/MGN)
- Tao Yang (LRST/MGN)
- Tianle Cheng (LRST/ALB)
- Tom Kalapos (PM, LRST/PGH)
- Yinkai Lei (LRST/ALB)
- Yoosuf Picard (LRST/PGH)
- Youngseok Jee (LRST/PGH)
- Yueh-Lin Lee (LRST/PGH)

Clemson University

- Kyle Brinkman (MSE)
- Jack Duffy (MSE, PhD student)

Penn State University

- Long-Qing Chen (MSE)
- Yanzhou Ji (MSE)

University of Wisconsin-Madison

- Dane Morgan (MSE)
- Ryan Jacobs (MSE)
- Chiyoung Kim (MSE PhD student)

Wake Forest University

• Michael Gross (Chemistry)

West Virginia University

- Harry Finklea (Chemistry)
- Ismail Celik (MAE)
- David Mebane (MAE)
- Ed Sabolsky (MAE)
- Joshua Tenney (PhD student)
- Xueyan Song (MAE)
- Xingbo Liu (MAE)
- Yun Chen (WV Research Corp.)

3



NETL SOC Capability Overview

CHALLENGE: SOC technology is cost prohibitive due to long-term performance degradation **APPROACH:** Develop degradation modeling and mitigation tools to improve performance / longevity of SSEC

Systems Engineering and Analysis

- Techno-Economic Analysis
- Hybrid configuration assessment
- **R&D** Goals Evaluation



Performance Degradation Modeling

- Degradation prediction tools
- Atoms-to-System scale bridging
- Experimental validation

Increasing Scale

tools

Machine learning-

informed design

Advanced Gas, Temperature Sensors

LSM/YSZ

Porosity

D-LSM

D-YSZ

D-pore



- Degradation mitigation
- Microstructure optimization
- Technology transfer to industry
- System demonstrations



Impact of microstructural features on lifetime performance





Time [h]

SOFC FWP Focus in FY22



• **Development** and **utilization** of degradation modeling framework

- More degradation modes
- Expansion to SOEC and r-SOC operation
- New material sets
- More big data analysis
- Machine learning to develop more durable, higher performing electrodes

• Proton-conducting SOC materials

- Computational chemistry studies
- Experimental characterization

Reversible SOC studies

- Systems configurations
- Experimental characterization



Output: 2022 Project Review Posters



- H. Kim, et al., "Effect of Microstructural Variability and Operating Condition on Cr-poisoning in Solid Oxide Fuel Cell Cathode Using HPC Simulations"
- J. Liu, et al., "Unconventional Highly Active and Stable Oxygen Reduction Catalysts Informed by Computational Design Strategies"
- J. Tenney, et al., "Additive Manufacturing of Anode-Supported SOFCs through Aerosol Deposition"
- T. Yang, et al., "Numerical Study to Optimize the Microstructure of an LSM/YSZ Backbone for Nanoparticle Infiltration"
- W. Epting, et al., "Rapid Assessment of SOC Electrode Degradation Using Computer Vision and Machine Learning"
- Y. Chen, et al., "Sr Surface Segregation & Grain Boundary Degradation of LSCF/SDC Oxygen Electrode Operated in Both Fuel Cell and Electrolysis Mode"
- Y. Fan, et al., "Nanoparticles Infiltration in Air Electrode of LSM-YSZ/YSZ/Ni-YSZ Cells to Improve Performance and Mitigate Performance Degradation under Reversible SOFC/SOEC Operation"
- Y.L. Lee, et al., "Defect Thermodynamics and Transport Properties of Proton Conducting Oxide BaZr_{1-x}Y_xO_{3-δ} (x≤0.1) Evaluated Based on Density Functional Theory Modeling"
- Y. Lei, et al., "Modeling Ni Redistribution in the Fuel Electrode of Solid Oxide Cells"
- Y. Mantz, Y.L. Lee, "Surface Energies of LaMnO₃ High-Index Surfaces Obtained from Density-Functional Theory"



Cell and Stack Degradation Modeling

Simulation-driven design of advanced SOCs



Integrated Cell Degradation Model

Time (h)





used in SOFC, SOEC, and r-SOC mode with multiple modes.

Analyzing performance degradation

- Simulations run on database of synthetic microstructure covering large matrix of microstructural parameter combinations
- How do you decide what's a good or bad electrode?

Need a single figure-of-merit that captures **both** <u>initial performance</u> and <u>stability</u>

Lifetime energy production chosen.

Presently: operation at a given current density, up to a given time

Cathode Feature Importance Ranking

Each cathode feature's impact on lifetime energy produced at 400 mA/cm²

Low LSM/YSZ ratio, low porosity, and small solid particles are beneficial

Machine Learning and Degradation

- Use 11 initial microstructural values as "features" (inputs, known values for each sample)
- Lifetime energy produced at 400 mA/cm² as "target" (outcome, value to be predicted)

Training dataset

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF

W. K. Epting et al., ECS Trans., 103, 909 (2021). Z. Yan et al., Energy Convers. Manag. 198 (2019)

Machine Learning and Microstructure

Getting hi-res properties from cheaper, more available low-res techniques

NATIONAL ENERGY TECHNOLOGY LABORATORY

Machine learning vs. Percolation Theory

Trained ML models can provide more reliable microstructural parameter input values for simulation studies

tpb - MAPE 2.123 % tpb - MAPE 13.402 % 0.35 sa12 - MAPE 92.862 % sa12 - MAPE 2.082 % 0.35 sa13 - MAPE 93.998 % sa13 - MAPE 2.185 % sa23 - MAPE 1.426 % sa23 - MAPE 87.470 % 0.30 0.30 0.25 0.25 0.20 Count 0.20 Issues with interfacial areas 0.15 0.15 0.10 0.10 0.05 0.05 0.00 0.00 70 80 90 100 110 120 25 100 125 50 75 150 175 200 Rel. prediction error [%] Rel. prediction error [%]

NN Regressor

Percolation Theory

Comparison: TPB Density

NN Regressor

Predictions from Lower Quality 3D Data

NATIONAL ENERGY

Predictions from Lower Quality 3D Data

Remains to be seen: How much the uncertainty increases over a wider operational space with more degradation modes

Additional Degradation Models

Simulation of Mechanical Degradation Considering Microstructures

- Last year: Phase field modeling of mechanical cracking from thermal and redox cycling
- This year: model expanded to include O₂ pressure buildup in air electrode during SOEC operation

$$P_{O_2} = P_{O_2}^{Pore} \exp\left[\frac{4F}{RT}\eta_{anode}\right]$$

Modified Virkar model from Int. J. Hydrog. Energy 35(18) 9527, 2010.

$$P_{\rm O_2} = \sqrt{\frac{\pi\gamma E}{2(1-\upsilon^2)c}}$$

γ: Interfacial energyν: Poisson's ratio

E: Young's modulus c: Initial crack size Microstructure

Oxygen pressure (atm)

When c=0.5 μ m and γ =1.75 Jm⁻², critical inner oxygen pressure P₀₂=1.13*10⁴ atm, and critical overpotential η_{anode} =237 mV

Additional Degradation Models

NATIONAL ENERGY TECHNOLOGY LABORATORY

Simulation of secondary phase formation

- Developed a general thermodynamic model of non-stoichiometric phases, and applied it to SOFC systems, starting with LSM and LSCF.
 - Computer program developed to apply the thermodynamic model to given sublattice systems.
- Initially applied to simulate zirconate formation during sintering

Electrode Design and Engineering

Building better performing, longer lasting electrodes

20

SOC Electrode Design and Engineering

TL RECHNO

Objectives

- Enhancement of performance and longevity
- Materials engineering
- Microstructure engineering

Benefits

- Cell/stack cost reduction
- Cell overpotential reduction
- Increased thermo-chemical/thermo-mechanical stability
- Reduced cost-of-electricity and/or cost of hydrogen

DESIGN new materials and structuresDEVELOP tailored electrode designsDEPLOY in commercial SOC systems

Simulating infiltrated electrodes: Sub-volumes

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF

21

 Using ERMINE SOFC module in MOOSE platform for microstructurally resolved infiltration (individual nanoparticles) to how infiltrated particle parameters impact local electrochemical performance/degradation

Comparing performance improvement on 2 selected LSM/YSZ subvolumes when infiltrating different loadings of LSM and YSZ nanoparticles

*Open-source framework from Idaho National Laboratory that allows customized physics.

ATIONAL

Simulating infiltrated electrodes: Full cells

- Using in house DREAM SOFC code to optimize cathode performance by controlling infiltration and backbone structure
 - Optimal catalytic properties for a given backbone composition/structure
 - Optimal backbone composition/structure for given catalytic properties
 - Optimal lifetime performance based on backbone/infiltrated particle degradation

Volume fractions:	Particle size:				
40:60	-1,0,1,2,3,4				
50:50	0 = Baseline				
60:40	-1 = Coarser				
	1-4 = Finer				

Infiltrating LSC onto LSM/YSZ backbone

0.025

(G) **bemiz** 0.015 0.011

0.005

0.03

0.025

ਰੁ ^{0.02}

0.015 0.015 **D** 0.01

0.005

10-2

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF

(9)

0 0.04

NATIONAL ENERGY

Proton-conducting SOCs

Expanding the degradation modeling framework's material sets

- Proton-conducting SOCs can help lower operating temperatures, increase operational stability, and don't have a diluted H₂ stream
- Materials needs:
 - More active electrodes
 - Electrolytes with higher σ , higher H⁺ transference number
 - Less expensive thermal processing
- SOEC, SOFC performance model code options created for proton-conducting systems
 - Model not fully calibrated due to lack of comprehensive calibration dataset

Proton-conducting materials studies

• Electrolyte studies:

- Defect Thermodynamics and Transport Properties of Proton Conducting Oxide Electrolyte BaZr_{1-x}Y_xO_{3- δ} (x \leq 0.1)
- Experimental measurement of conductivities and transference numbers of BaZr_xCe_yY_zYb_{1-x-y-z}O₃

• Triple-conducting oxide studies for electrodes:

- Computational study of H⁺ transport in Ba(Co, Fe, Zr, Y)O_{3-δ} based on [V₀[…]], cation arrangement, and amount of Y substitution
- Experimental measurement of conductivities, H₂/O₂ permeation, and transference numbers of BCFZ/Y compositions

Motivation: Reducing gradients in planar cells

NATIONAL ENERGY TECHNOLOGY LABORATORY

Mitigating long-term degradation through advanced electrode design

#	Description	Porosity (ε_p)	Ni/YSZ Ratio
0	Baseline	0.25	0.5
1	Porosity 0.1-0.3	$\varepsilon_p = 0.2 \left(\frac{z}{L}\right) + 0.1$	0.5
2	Ni/YSZ 0.27-0.5	0.25	$R_{Ni} = 0.23 \left(\frac{z}{L}\right) + 0.27$
3	Ni/YSZ 0.27-0.5 ^ 1.5	0.25	$R_{Ni} = 0.23 \left(\frac{z}{L}\right)^{15} + 0.27$
4	Ni 0.25 0.37 0.50	0.25	$R_{Ni} = \begin{cases} 0.27 & 0 \le z < L/3 \\ 0.35 & L/3 \le z < 2L/3 \\ 0.5 & 2L/3 \le z \le L \end{cases}$

Temperature gradient can be reduced by varying Ni:YSZ ratio from inlet to outlet

1050

1000

10-3

10-2

10-1

10⁰

time [s]

10¹

 10^{2}

26

Additive manufacturing of SOC electrodes

Creating 3D gradients in composition, microstructure

- Automated aerosol spray deposition system built at WVU to fabricate SOC electrodes and electrolytes
 - Feedstocks provide precursors with varying compositions, particle sizes
 - Started with 4 feedstocks that could be pumped through spray nozzle
 - Upgraded to in situ mixing system for wider range of compositions
- Ongoing studies to deposit both electrodes, electrolyte, and barrier layers to support layer
- System coupled with simulations to optimize long-term performance in planar cells

100% LSCF	5 Micron Hydroxyl Modified PMMA
70/30 LSCF/YSZ	3 Micron Hydroxyl Modified PMMA
50/50 LSCF/YSZ	1.5 Micron Hydroxyl Modified PMMA
SDC Barrier layer	
YSZ	

Spray deposited electrode layers with varied electrode composition and pore size on top of electrolyte substrate

Example layout of 5x5 cm² electrode with 3D gradients in composition and microstructure

Note: YSZ used in demonstration for cost considerations

Josh Tenney

Strategic Systems Analysis and Engineering

Defining SOEC, SOFC, and R-SOC operation in the modern grid

SOC Cell and Stack Cost Production Tool

- Previous SOFC cell and stack production cost tool was expanded to include SOEC production and additional cell geometries
- Spreadsheet tool includes all necessary cost inputs
 - Raw materials, equipment, energy, etc.
- Sensitivity studies can be conducted on SOFCs and SOECs
 - Total production, materials costs, etc.
- Detailed guidance document/instructions available

OSTI Identifier: 1842511 Report Number: DOE/NETL-2022/3230

Newly released reports

- Techno-Economic Analysis of Integrated Gasification Fuel Cell Systems (Report DOE/NETL-2022-3250) and Techno-Economic Analysis of Natural Gas Fuel Cell Plant Configurations (Report DOE/NETL-2022/3259)
 - Updated technological pathway studies for ~550 MW IGFC and NGFC configurations considering carbon capture and storage, different gasification technologies, and pressurized operation provides targeted research guidance

Case Designation	Pathway Parameter	Case ID	SOFC Pressure (atm)	Internal Reformation (%)	SOFC Technology	Capacity Factor (%)	Degradation (%/1000 h)	Fuel Utilization (%)	Inverter Efficiency	Stack Cost (\$/kW)		
Reference	Reference with CCS	ANGFC0B	1	60	Advanced Cell	80		80%				
(Case 0)		PNGFC0B	3									
61	85% Fuel Utilization	ANGFC1B	1					85%				
Case I		PNGFC1B	3						97%	225		
C D	85% Capacity Factor	ANGFC2B	1									
Case 2		PNGFC2B	3				0.2					
Case 2BV	With VGR	ANGFC2BV	1					> 90%				
62	100% Internal Reformation	ANGFC3B	1	-								
Case 3		PNGFC3B	3									
Case 4	BOP Enhancements ANGFC4B 20% ASU Power Reduction, Inverter Efficiency 98%, Stack Cost Reduction PNGFC4B	1	100		85		85%					
		PNGFC4B	3						98%	200		
Case 4BV	With VGR	ANGFC4BV	1							> 90%		

NGFC Pathway Study

Ongoing System Studies

- Techno-Economic Analysis (TEA) of H₂-fueled SOFCs
- Preliminary TEA of R-SOC System configurations, considering fully R-SOC stacks vs. separate SOFC and SOEC stacks

Wrap-Up

Key Points

- Integrated degradation modeling framework expanded with more materials, more degradation modes, more operating modes, more data analysis
- Synthetic microstructure database, microstructural analysis tools are available for use
- Access to degradation framework available through collaboration
 - Help interpret impedance data
 - Move beyond correlation
 - Get recommendations on how much your cell can be improved
 - Workshop for SOFC Program partners anticipated in Spring 2023!
- Additive manufacturing and infiltration capabilities developed and available to create electrodes with engineered gradients
- Systems analysis tools and reports have been released. Look for upcoming reports exploring reversible systems.

Output: 2022 Project Review Posters

- 1. H. Kim, et al., "Effect of Microstructural Variability and Operating Condition on Cr-poisoning in Solid Oxide
- 2. Fuel Cell Cathode Using HPC Simulations"
- 3. J. Liu, et al., "Unconventional Highly Active and Stable Oxygen Reduction Catalysts Informed by Computational Design Strategies"
- 4. J. Tenney, et al., "Additive Manufacturing of Anode-Supported SOFCs through Aerosol Deposition"
- 5. T. Yang, et al., "Numerical Study to Optimize the Microstructure of an LSM/YSZ Backbone for Nanoparticle
- 6. Infiltration"
- 7. W. Epting, et al., "Rapid Assessment of SOC Electrode Degradation Using Computer Vision and Machine Learning"
- 8. Y. Chen, et al., "Sr Surface Segregation & Grain Boundary Degradation of LSCF/SDC Oxygen Electrode
- 9. Operated in Both Fuel Cell and Electrolysis Mode"
- 10. Y. Fan, et al., "Nanoparticles Infiltration in Air Electrode of LSM-YSZ/YSZ/Ni-YSZ Cells to Improve Performance and Mitigate Performance Degradation under Reversible SOFC/SOEC Operation"
- 11. Y.L. Lee, et al., "Defect Thermodynamics and Transport Properties of Proton Conducting Oxide BaZr1xYxO3-δ (x≤0.1) Evaluated Based on Density Functional Theory Modeling"
- 12. Y. Lei, et al., "Modeling Ni Redistribution in the Fuel Electrode of Solid Oxide Cells"
- 13. Y. Mantz, Y.L. Lee, "Surface Energies of LaMnO3 High-Index Surfaces Obtained from Density-Functional Theory"

- 1. T. Yang, et al., "Multiphysics modeling of SOFC performance degradation caused by interface delamination and active layer cracking," International Journal of Hydrogen Energy (accepted 9/2022)
- 2. Y.L. Lee, et al., "Defect Thermodynamics and Transport Properties of Proton Conducting Oxide BaZr1xYxO3-δ (x≤0.1) Guided Based on Density Functional Theory Modeling," **JOM** (accepted 9/2022)
- 3. Y. Lei, et al., "Modeling Ni redistribution in the hydrogen electrode of solid oxide cells through Ni(OH)2 diffusion and Ni-YSZ wettability change," **Journal of Power Sources** 545, 231924, 2022.
- 4. Y. Chen, et al., "Space charge layer evolution at yttria-stabilized zirconia grain boundaries upon operation of solid oxide fuel cells," Acta Materialia 237, 1188179, 2022.
- 5. T. Hsu, et al., "High performance finite element simulations of infiltrated solid oxide fuel cell cathode microstructures," **Journal of Power Sources** 541, 231652, 2022.
- 6. R. Jacobs, et al., "Unconventional Highly Active and Stable Oxygen Reduction Catalysts Informed by Computational Design Strategies," **Advanced Energy Materials**, 2201203, 2022.
- 7. Y. Ji, et al., "Thermodynamic models of multicomponent nonstoichiometric solution phases using internal process order parameters," Acta Materialia 23, 117462, 2022.
- 8. J.H. Duffy, et al., "Surface and Bulk Oxygen Kinetics of BaCo0.4Fe0.4Zr0.2–XYXO3–δ Triple Conducting Electrode Materials," **Membranes** 11(10) 766, 2021.

Additional SOC Efforts

Aris Energy Solutions

- 5.6 kW demonstration in Morgantown
- Project: DE-FE31978

H₂NEW Laboratory Consortium (EERE/HFTO)

- Modeling SOFC degradation from coal gas contaminants
- Project: DE-FE31977

 Modeling and characterization performance degradation of SOECs

NATIONAL ENERGY TECHNOLOGY LABORATORY

 This work was performed in support of the U.S. Department of Energy's (DOE) Fossil Energy and Carbon Management's Solid Oxide Fuel Cell Research Program and executed through the National Energy Technology Laboratory (NETL) Research & Innovation Center's Solid Oxide Fuel Cell FWP 1022411.

Disclaimer: This project was funded by the United States Department of Energy, National Energy Technology Laboratory, in part, through a site support contract. Neither the United States Government nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, nor the support contractor, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof.

THANK YOU!

VISIT US AT: www.NETL.DOE.gov

Harry Abernathy, Ph.D.

Group Leader, Solid Oxide Cell Research National Energy Technology Laboratory U. S. Department of Energy 304-285-4632 Harry.Abernathy@netl.doe.gov

