Beneficial Reuse of CO$_2$ from Coal Fired Power Plants for Production of Animal Feeds

U.S. DOE, Office of Fossil Energy, NETL
Agreement DE-FE0031717, 2019–2022, Andy Aurelio, PM

MicroBio Engineering, Inc.
San Luis Obispo, California
Orlando, Florida

• Tryg Lundquist, PhD, PE, PI*, presenting
• Ruth Spierling, Sr. Engineer, Site Manager
• Cooper Gibson, Mechanical Eng., TEA-LCA
• John Benemann, PhD

* Also Civil & Environmental Engineering, Cal Poly State Univ.,
Goal: Advance commercialization of animal feed produced through flue gas CO₂ utilization.

- Funding
  - DOE NETL: $1,442,854
  - Cost Share: $300,595 mostly OUC

- Project Performance
  - 1/1/2019 to 3/31/2022 extended

- Project Participants
  - MicroBio Engineering Inc. (MBE)
  - Orlando Utilities Commission (OUC)
  - Cal Poly State University (CP)
  - University of Central Florida (UCF)
  - Global Thermostat (GT)

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
General CO$_2$ Utilization Goals

Develop technologies/products that:

1. Allow industries to sell large quantities of CO$_2$ as a feedstock, which offsets some cost of capture, utilization, and sequestration.

2. CO$_2$-derived commodities need large markets and high value.

3. The commodities should reduce net GHG emissions by substituting “bioproducts” for fossil-derived products or conventional products with higher GHG emissions.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Microalgae Fit the Need

1. High-value composition for feed or food is possible.
   - Algae can contain omega-3s, xanthophyll, protein, oils.

2. Assimilate CO$_2$ from flue gas directly.

3. Higher productivity (yield) than other crops.

4. Can use non-agricultural land (salinized, poor soil)

5. Can use non-agricultural water (saline, brackish)


7. 2018 Farm Bill made algae a US Dept. of Agriculture “Title Crop” qualifying it for crop insurance, etc.
Algae in feeds gives potentially better animal performance and better consumer products.

Claims include improved:

• Animal health and productivity
• Health benefits to consumers
• Appearance of the final product

Source: NBO3 website

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Paddle Wheel Mixed Raceway Ponds
The major commercial technology for microalgal biomass production and used in most TEA studies.

- ~1-ft (30 cm) deep
- Mixed at 20-25 cm/s
- CO₂ sparged in water
- pH control 7.5-8.2
- Fertilize with N, P, K and micronutrients

Seambiotic pilot plant, Israel, first to use flue gas from a coal-fired power plant

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Example: Algae containing the omega-3 fatty acid, EPA, are produced by Qualitas Health/IWi in New Mexico.
The Gulf Coast and especially Florida are thought to be ideal locations for an algae industry. Suitable climates limited to lower latitudes. 5 billion gallons of liquid fuels produced in 2900 farms. 2014 Venteris, Skaggs, Wigmosta, Coleman
CO₂ delivery involves optimization of concentration in pipeline and gas-to-liquid exchange device. CO₂ concentrator adds costs but pure CO₂ decreases transport cost and improves gas exchange rate.
Project objectives and technical-economic challenges.

- How much net CO₂ mitigation can be achieved with premium algae feeds?
- How can productivity and composition be maximized to improve process economics and land use?
- What will the CO₂ offset cost after commodity animal feed revenues?
- Develop detailed site specific TEA and LCA for OUC SEC for CO₂ mitigation for premium animal feeds.
Task 3 Goal: Larger-scale production, harvesting, dewatering and drying, for feed production.

*We start with Task 3 because it includes the facility setup needed for the other tasks.*

- Task 3.0 Algae feed production using flue gas CO₂
  - Subtask 3.1: Design, Fabrication, Installation, Start-up of 43-m² ponds (MBE/OUC)
  - Subtask 3.2: Algae Cultivation CO₂ Utilization, Biomass Production (MBE/OUC)
150 m² of raceway ponds installed at SEC for cultivation experiments and biomass production.

Continuous monitoring and control via internet-enabled instrumentation
Filamentous algae are being harvested and dehydrated for shipment to Cal Poly, where additional poultry feeding trials will be conducted.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Task 2 Goal: Highly productive, stable strains in outdoor cultures for animal feeds.

**MBE California strains**
- Omega-3 fatty acid producing filaments from California: *Tribonema minus*
- Spirulina, UTEX culture collection, media can store CO$_2$

**SEC local strains**
- Omega-3 fatty acid filament: *Uronema* sp. isolated on site. Identified using 16S RNA
- High protein and pigment: *Oedogonium, Hydrodictyon, Uronema, Vaucheria, etc.*
Cultivatable strains prospected locally at SEC.

- Oedogonium sp. & Compsopogon sp.
- Hydrodictyon sp. & Oedogonium sp.
- Uronema sp.
- Spirogyra sp. & Uronema sp.
- Vaucheria sp.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Cultures are scaled-up from test tube to bubble column to carboy to pond.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Pond operational methods were tested to achieve high productivity but also culture stability.

Hydraulic residence time, concentration and water dilution frequency affect productivity and culture stability. Short HRT promotes high productivity, but long HRT can promote culture stability.

Uronema is most stable and productive at 9.8 g/m²-d ann. avg.
Screen harvesting was greater than 90% effective for 55-600 µm screens and gravity settling.

Average % harvested with 55-600 µm screens

- Uronema sp. (2-day HRT): 95%
- Uronema sp. (3-day HRT): 88%
- Polyculture (4-day HRT): 93%
- Tribonema minus (4-day HRT): 94%

>20% solids after dewatering.
5 hr for dehydration.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Task 4: Determine the CO₂ utilization efficiency

- Task 4.0 Carbon Mass Balances during flue gas utilization
- Sized and designed a flue gas blower to meet algal demands
Task 5 Goal: Determine the potential of algae biomass as a value-added feed for chickens.

- Task 5.0 Poultry Feeding Trials with Algal Biomass (CP)
  - Subtask 5.1 – Feed Manufacturing and Analysis
    * Nearly 100 kg of dried biomass delivered to Cal Poly
  - Subtask 5.2 – Layer Feeding Trials
  - Subtask 5.3 – Broiler Feeding Trials

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Poultry feeding trials at Cal Poly State University

Diets
- Corn-soybean meal based
- Algae content (0-10%)  

Production parameters
- Egg production
- Egg quality
  - Egg size, eggshell quality
  - Yolk fatty acid analysis
- Feed conversion
- Bone strength
- Meat quality
- Skin color

Animal Scientists: Drs. Darin Bennett and Mark Edwards
Layers and broilers were fed four filamentous algae diets: 3 isolated at OUC and 1 from California.

Feeding Formulation

**Step 1:** Determine algae biochemical composition.

**Step 2:** Measure digestibility of nutrients by mass/energy balances.

**Step 3:** Based on 1 & 2, formulate feed that can be properly compared to conventional feeds.
Digestibility trials completed. Production trials are in progress with OUC strains vs. conventional feed.

All 10 essential amino acids for poultry were digestible in algae, with Spirulina having the greatest quantities.

The algae ingredient had 30% greater energy content than conventional feed.

Algae pigments improve yolk color.
Task 6 Goal: Use project outcomes in TEA-LCA assessment studies.

Task 6.0 Engineering and Technoeconomic Analyses and Life Cycle Assessment (MBE/OUC/GT)
• Subtask 6.1 – Farm Engineering Design (MBE/OUC/GT)
• Subtask 6.2 – Techno-economic Assessment (TEA) (MBE)
• Subtask 6.3 – Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) (MBE)
• Subtask 6.4 – Gap Analysis (MBE)

Key inputs to the TEA-LCA from Experimental Work
• Low-cost, low energy harvesting with canal screens or parabolic harvesters possible.
• Low-cost, low energy dewatering reaches 20% solids
• Low temperature 35-70°C dehydration is able to effectively dry biomass with no degradation of the organic material
• Abundant waste heat ~43 °C is available on-site
400-ha (1000-acre) farm sited for Phase-1 project.

Future Algae Farm
(100 ponds; 1,000 acres)

Freshwater Ag Fertilizers

Animal Feeds

Flue Gas CO₂ & Electricity

OUC-SEC
~900 MW Coal-fired PP

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Map shows >10,000 acres on undeveloped land near SEC, with pipeline routing, for Phase-2.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
CO₂ Costs at Algae Facility Gate (Linde-Sapphire 2014)

- “Capture” systems are post-combustion MEA.
- Most economical delivery method within 16 km (10 miles) is low pressure delivery of flue gas from a coal fired power plant (CFPP)

---

CO₂ cost at battery limit

- CFPP capture
- GT capture
- GT flue gas
- CFPP flue gas
- 18% CO₂

A ... 1 stage → 2 stage blower
B ... 44" → 48" pipeline
C ... 1 pipeline → 2 parallel lines
D ... blower → multi-stage compressor

CFPP=Coal Fired Power Plant, GT= Natural Gas Turbine power plant

Property of Linde, © Linde 2014
TEA General Methods

- Economics **aligned with NREL methodology** (2017 NREL “Algae Harmonization Study”).
- 30-year cash flow analysis at **10% IRR** and “nth” plant cost assumptions.
- The wetted area of all the sub-facilities totals **~10,000 acres**.
- **Applied 45Q Tax Credit** to the cash flow analysis due to net negative GHG emissions for the proposed algae process. See table below.

### 45Q, Types of Sources and Credit Between 2018-2026

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facility Type</th>
<th>Power Plant</th>
<th>Industrial Facility</th>
<th>Direct Air Capture</th>
<th>Credit in 2026 ($/t)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dedicated Storage</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOR</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.*
Production Facility CapEx (Preliminary)

Total Capital Investment: ~$1B

Assumptions

Production Ponds: 4-ha clay-bottom ponds with lined walls.

CO₂ Delivery: Low pressure flue gas delivery from co-located power plant.

Dewatering: Canal screens for harvesting and screw presses to thicken biomass to ~20% solids.

Site Development: Includes topographical surveying, land preparation, grubbing, grading and infrastructure development (roads, fences, etc...)

Project Contingency: Assumed at 10% of total direct costs, per NREL Harmonization Report.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
CapEx + OpEx Mean Feed Selling Price (Prelim.)

Minimum Feed Selling Price: **$699/mt** which is less than the projected feed value of $1000-$1200/mt.

Assumptions

**CO₂ Costs:** $18-$37/mt CO₂ delivered to facility gate for the four pipelines.

**Labor Costs:** Sourced from NREL 2017 Harmonization Report and adjusted based on sub-facility size.

**Capital Depreciation:** IRS Modified Accelerated Cost Recovery System (MACRS), assuming 7-year recovery period.

**Average ROI:** Assuming 40% equity financing at 10% after tax IRR.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
LCA methods used for both algae and soybeans

1. NETL’s OpenLCA CO2U Database and methods were used (T. Skone et al.)
   • LCA Approach: “Consequential” - algal animal feed compared to whole soy beans.
   • Functional unit: kg of animal feed trucked (diesel) 500 miles to animal production farms
   • Power plant “sized” for 100% flue gas delivered to 4,000 ha (10,000 ac) of algae facilities (next slide)
   • Same kWh generated by both algae and soybean cases.
   • TRACI 2.0 set of impacts (climate & other air pollutants, eutrophication, human health, etc.)

2. Ecoinvent inventory implementation
   • Comparison product system (whole soybean) included the steps:
     • Sow, till, fertilize, apply pesticides, and harvest.
     • Dry whole soybeans to 12% moisture w/ solar + natural gas finish.
     • Power plant, without CO$_2$ concentration, transported cradle-to-algae facility gate
Algae had lower emissions than soybean feeds. 

Electricity co-product set equal for both cases. Preliminary results.

Algae Animal Feed
Net +0.05 kg CO$_{2e}$/kg feed

Soy Animal Feed
Net +1.6 kg CO$_{2e}$/kg feed

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Take-Aways So Far

• Local strains with omega-3 and -6 were prospected, isolated and cultivated.

• Local algae have been more stable than non-native.

• Low-cost screen harvesting, dewatering and drying developed.

• Cultivated year-round.

• Improved yolk color with algae feeds

• Scrubbed flue gas gives same productivity and algae quality as pure CO₂.

• Algae cost $300-$500 per mt less than the projected value of the feed (4,000-ha scale).

• 4,000 ha would fix 10% of OUC-SEC CO₂.

• Beneficial GHG impact vs. soybean feed.

TrygLundquist@MicroBioEngineering.com
Appendix

• These slides will not be discussed during the presentation, but are mandatory.

• Team Description and Task Assignments
• Schedule of Milestones and Deliverables
MBE Team Details

Ruth Spierling, MS, PhD candidate, MBE/UCF, Env. Eng., 9 years conducting and managing algae and fermentation projects.

Jesse Conklin, BS, Biology, trained in sterile technique, indoor/outdoor cultivation, analytical techniques.

Two additional student technicians

Cooper Gibson, BS, Mech. Eng., MBE, TEA-LCA, facility design

Neal Adler, MS, Civil Eng., MBE, facility design

Braden Crowe, BS, Chem. Eng., MBE, carbonate system expert

Tryg Lundquist, PI

John Benemann, CEO
OUC Team Details

Justin Kramer, PE, Mech. Eng., Supervisor of Emerging Technologies
Rubin York, Project Manager, Emerging Technologies
Nathan Parker, Engineer, Stanton Energy Center
Jim Shoemaker, Managing Chemist, Gardenia Laboratory
Various tradesmen and EH&S personnel at Stanton.

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
All subcontracts originate directly from MBE.

Darin Bennett, PhD, Poultry Science Prof., Cal Poly State University
Mark Edwards, PhD, Animal Science Prof., Cal Poly State University
Woo-Hyoung Lee, PhD, Env. Eng. Professor, UCF, CO₂ tracking, cultivation
Jaehoon Hwang, PhD, Env. Eng. UCF, CO₂ tracking, cultivation
3 grad and undergrad UCF engineering students
Ron Chance, PhD, PE, Chemistry, Vice President R&D, Global Thermostat

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Project Milestones, 1 of 2

• ML-1: Commission three 43-m$^2$ raceway ponds at SEC.  
  Completed 9/2019

• ML-2: Commence Tribonema cultivation in ponds at SEC.  
  Completed 1/2020

• ML-3: Shipment of dry algae to Cal Poly for the layer feed trial.  
  Completed 9/2020

• ML-4: Complete growth rate comparison of three filamentous strains including Tribonema.  
  Completed 6/2020

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
Project Milestones, 2 of 2

• ML-5: Demonstrate 90% harvesting of algae biomass and dewatering to 20% solids at pilot scale.  
Completed 6/2021

• ML-6: Shipment of dry algae to Cal Poly for the broiler feed trial.  
68 kg produced, 4 kg remaining.  
Expected 9/2021

• ML-7: Demonstrate in algae produced at OUC equivalent omega-3 fatty acid productivity as baseline algae grown by MBE in California.  
Completed 11/2020

• ML-8: Improve carbon uptake efficiency by 25% over baseline.  
Expected 2/2022

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.
# Project Deliverable Status

Some tasks delayed by Covid labor restrictions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Task No.</th>
<th>Due date</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2-28-19</td>
<td>Project management plan</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6-30-19</td>
<td>Technology maturation plan</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9-30-19</td>
<td>Cultivation optimization interim report</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9-30-19</td>
<td>Productivity interim report</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1-31-20</td>
<td>Preliminary TEA results</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2-28-22</td>
<td>Feeding trial interim report</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12-31-21</td>
<td>Carbon utilization interim report</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7-31-20</td>
<td>Preliminary LCA results</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9-30-20</td>
<td>Preliminary gap analysis</td>
<td>Complete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3-31-22</td>
<td>Final Report</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tryg Lundquist, MicroBio Engineering Inc.